

Rory Robertson
18 June 2018

Letter 1: Professor Jennie Brand-Miller at #Food4Thought18 conference in Zurich, 14 & 15 June 2018

rory robertson < strathburnstation@gmail.com >

To: fgodlee@bmj.com , wwillett@hsph.harvard.edu , david.ludwig@childrens.harvard.edu , jioannid@stanford.edu , redberg@medicine.ucsf.edu , dariusz.mozaffarian@tufts.edu , jose.ordovas@tufts.edu , nita.forouhi@mrc-epid.cam.ac.uk , Günter.Hemrich@fao.org , Mike.Lean@glasgow.ac.uk , rafael.perez-escamilla@yale.edu , mschulze@dife.de , tim.spector@kcl.ac.uk , roy.taylor@ncl.ac.uk , Martin.White@mrc-epid.cam.ac.uk , yusufs@mcmaster.ca , taubes@gmail.com , zoe@theobesityepidemic.org , aseem_malhotra@hotmail.com , teicholz@gmail.com , nladher@bmj.com

Dear Dr Godlee and other speakers at last week's Food for Thought conference,

I am an economist interested in incompetence and fraud at the highest levels of nutrition science and advice, so thank you all for your efforts in making last week's conference such an excellent, informative event: http://institute.swissre.com/events/food_for_thought_bmj.html#tab_5

Unfortunately, Australia's only representative last week is highly unreliable on diet-and-health matters. The University of Sydney's Professor Jennie Brand-Miller (JBM) is highly unreliable because:

(i) JBM's infamous 2011 *Australian Paradox* sugar-and-obesity paper is based on extraordinary confusion about up versus down, as well as a reckless reliance on fake/made up/unreliable/invalid sugar data: pp.19-

27 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Big-5-year-update-Feb-2017.pdf> ; <http://www.abc.net.au/lateline/health-experts-continue-to-dispute-sydney-uni/7324520> ; <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/ABC-investigation-AustralianParadox.pdf> ; <http://www.abc.net.au/radionational/programs/backgroundbriefing/2014-02-09/5239418>

(ii) JBM falsely claims in an Australian National University PhD thesis that her research-misconduct Inquiry in 2014 was the result of me providing a \$10,000 payment (bribe!) to University of Sydney Vice-Chancellor Michael Spence: pp. 1-4 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/USyd-Misconduct-in-ANU-PhD.pdf>

(iii) JBM founded and oversees the University of Sydney's (50%-owned) business that gets paid by food companies to put healthy "Low GI" (Glycemic Index) stamps on products that are up to 99.4% refined sugar, including sugar itself and yummy Milo (46% sugar). Great for kids and diabetics! p. 7 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/USyd-Misconduct-in-ANU-PhD.pdf>

(iv) Fructose is GI=19. It is perhaps the lowest-GI carbohydrate. So if added fructose and sucrose are harmful in modern doses (they are), JBM's Low-GI approach has for decades been worse than useless in identifying good and bad carbohydrates.

(v) JBM has sold millions of copies in a series of pop-sci diet books that make the blatant false claim that "**There is absolute consensus that [added] sugar in food does not cause [type 2] diabetes**": pp. 7-9 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/USyd-Misconduct-in-ANU-PhD.pdf>

(vi) Importantly, in your Day 1 conference video, Professor Brand-Miller features a chart - containing faked/made up/invalid/unreliable sugar data - that she published in the *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition (AJCN)*: minute 1:20:30 <https://youtu.be/acXICYKEzy4?t=4827>

(vii) JBM was able to publish that chart in the *AJCN* only after a University of Sydney security guard stopped me - at a public conference that I had paid to attend - from asking her about her prolonged pretending that clearly fake/made up/unreliable/invalid sugar data are reliable/valid (p. 77). Later, I was shocked to find that the Academic Head of the Charles Perkins Centre - Professor Stephen Simpson - and the main scientific author of Canberra's *Australian Dietary Guidelines* - Professor Stewart Truswell - helped JBM place shonky sugar data in the *AJCN*: pp. 28-38 and 64-78 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Big-5-year-update-Feb-2017.pdf> ; p. 6 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/USyd-Misconduct-in-ANU-PhD.pdf>

As I have documented above, when it comes to diet and health, JBM has serious problems with competence, integrity and financial conflicts of interest.

Much of what she says is clearly wrong. Accordingly, we should take JBM's claims on dietary sugar, fructose, "low GI" carbohydrates and other matters with a large grain of salt.

Finally, devoted to scientific integrity as you all are, could you seek, please, the formal retraction of JBM's extraordinarily faulty 2011 *Australian Paradox* paper, a formal paper that was self-published by JBM - acting as both author and Guest Editor - in MDPI's *Nutrients* journal? http://www.mdpi.com/journal/nutrients/special_issues/carbohydrates

Best wishes
Rory

Rory Robertson
21 June 2018

Letter 2 to Editor of *British Medical Journal*: Serious problems with scientific integrity at University of Sydney and Australian National University harming public health

rory robertson < strathburnstation@gmail.com >

To: fgodlee@bmj.com

cc: wwillett@hsph.harvard.edu , david.ludwig@childrens.harvard.edu , jioannid@stanford.edu , redberg@medicine.ucsf.edu , dariush.mozaffarian@tufts.edu , jose.ordovas@tufts.edu , nita.forouhi@mrc-epid.cam.ac.uk , Günter.Hemrich@fao.org , Mike.Lean@glasgow.ac.uk , rafael.perez-escamilla@yale.edu , mschulze@dife.de , tim.spector@kcl.ac.uk , roy.taylor@ncl.ac.uk , Martin.White@mrc-epid.cam.ac.uk , yusufs@mcmaster.ca , taubes@gmail.com , zoe@theobesityepidemic.org , aseem_malhotra@hotmail.com , teicholz@gmail.com , nladher@bmj.com

Dear Dr Godlee (and others near and far),

Thank you for your kind reply to my letter earlier this week.

I have published my letter online: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Letter-Dr-Fiona-Godlee.pdf>

This one too will be uploaded in time. I hope you do not mind. I am simply trying to keep as many people as possible - including scientists, journalists, university managers and public-health professionals - informed about the latest developments in this seven-year-old *Australian Paradox* saga, an epic I consider have become a serious scientific fraud, an academic disgrace and - most importantly - a menace to public health.

I am writing to you again so soon because suddenly I am under growing legal pressure to remove the following (15-page) Australian Broadcasting Commission (ABC) Investigation Report from my website: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/ABC-investigation-AustralianParadox.pdf>

Please urgently retain a copy of the Report for your records, to assist in any future investigations.

The background here is that two excellent ABC programs - broadcast nationally in 2014 and 2016 - highlighted my correct assessment that the 2011 *Australian Paradox* paper is extraordinarily faulty (and so, I claim, should be formally retracted): <http://www.abc.net.au/radionational/programs/backgroundbriefing/2014-02-09/5239418> ; <http://www.abc.net.au/lateline/health-experts-continue-to-dispute-sydney-uni/7324520>

In response to the *Lateline* program, presented by journalist Emma Alberici on ABC TV, Professor Jennie Brand-Miller (JBM) and co-author Dr Alan Barclay in 2016 wrote a **36-page letter of complaint** to the ABC claiming a range of serious factual errors.

The importance of the Audience and Consumer Affairs (A&CA) Investigation Report is that it confirms in detail that everything reported in the *Lateline* program is factually correct (a.k.a. "accurate and impartial according to the

recognised standards of objective journalism").

Indeed, I understand the *Lateline* program was nominated for a Walkley Award for excellence in Australian journalism.

Further, the A&CA Investigation Report confirms as blatantly untrue much of what JBM and Dr Barclay recklessly had published in 2017 in an Australian National University (ANU) PhD dissertation on "research silencing": <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/USyd-Misconduct-in-ANU-PhD.pdf>

I find the publication of JBM and Barclay's false allegations about me in that ANU PhD thesis highly offensive and defamatory. I intend to take the matter further. After all, I am a Master of Economics graduate of the ANU, and I'm gob-smacked that it is now awarding PhDs to people who don't bother to check publicly available facts, before launching an ANU document spoiled by false claims, unable to withstand the most basic scrutiny.

My sense is that Australian taxpayers are increasingly concerned that prestigious Group of Eight universities are becoming factories for degrees and "research", where lazy, sloppy and/or dishonest scholarship and false information are par for the course. That's certainly the evidence I've documented at Sydney University - and now ANU - during the many twists and turns in this long-running *Australian Paradox* scandal.

Anyway, back to today's key issue: I'm not sure what my legal position is in relation to the publication of the A&CA Investigation Report on my website, given that this is a serious public-health matter.

There is a clear precedent here: in 2014, the ABC - citing potential harm to public health - published the A&CA Investigation Report into Dr Maryanne Demasi's "Heart of the Matter" Catalyst shows: <http://about.abc.net.au/wp-content/uploads/2014/05/Catalyst-Heart-of-the-Matter-ACA-Investigation-Report.pdf>

Regarding the *Australian Paradox* scandal, the A&CA Investigation Report (2016) confirms that JBM is recklessly exaggerating her evidence that modern doses of added sugar are not a key driver of Australia's obesity and type 2 diabetes crisis:

- the Report specifically confirms my claim that JBM confused a 30% increase in sugary softdrink sales between 1994 and 2006 with a 10% decline (pp.8-10) and that several of JBM's own published charts - each trending up not down - clearly contradict her main 2011 conclusion of a "consistent and substantial decline" in sugar consumption over the 1980 to 2010 timeframe;
- the Report specifically assesses my claim that JBM is using fake/unreliable (scientifically unacceptable) data to be well-based (pp. 5-7 and 12-13);
- the Report specifically confirms the relevance of my detailed email interaction with the United Nations' Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) in 2012; that is, before I went public in 2012 with my concerns about the veracity of JBM's preferred data series that dead-ends in 2003, the FAO specifically confirmed to me that its Australian sugar series for the 2000-2003 period is based on a single data point (1999) from the Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) series that was discontinued as unreliable after 1998-99: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/FAOfalsifiedsugar.pdf> ; <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/New-nonsense-based-sugarreport.pdf>

JBM knows all this. Troublingly, the **Academic Director of the Charles Perkins Centre**, Professor Stephen Simpson - who helped JBM publish unreliable sugar data in the *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition (AJCN)* in 2017 <https://youtu.be/acXICYKEzy4?t=4827> - also knows all this, because I told him personally at Obesity Australia's annual conference at the ANU in 2013: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/LettersCPCProfSimpson.pdf>

I also informed both Professor Jill Trehwella and Professor Robert Clark AO who conducted the University of Sydney's *Australian Paradox* research-integrity

Inquiry: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/LettersProfTrehwella.pdf> ; <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Sept2012-Conversations.pdf>

Amazingly, the University of Sydney's research-integrity *Initial Inquiry Report* in 2014 disingenuously "disappeared" the fact that the FAO's data for 2000-2003 are faked/made-up/unreliable (scientifically unacceptable), by "disappearing" my seven-letter interaction with the FAO and inventing the fiction that my statements about the FAO's (conspicuously flat,

made-up, dead-ending in 2003) data being shonky "do not appear to be based on detailed evidence or inquiry": pp. 34-38 and pp. 76-80 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Big-5-year-update-Feb-2017.pdf>

Disturbingly, after having been formally advised by the ABC that none of her complaints about the veracity of my facts (in her 36-page letter) are valid, instead of formally retracting her extraordinarily faulty 2011 *Australian Paradox* paper, JBM wilfully chose to continue to use a discredited story based on unreliable/invalid data to help the sugary foods and beverage industries to campaign against "sugar tax" proposals, proposals currently supported by the Australian Medical Association and the Grattan Institute, as well as Senator Richard Di Natale and his Greens party in Federal Parliament: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/australian-sugar-tax-debate.pdf>; p. 46 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Big-5-year-update-Feb-2017.pdf>

How is all that I have documented above not serious "research misconduct"? Blind Freddie can see "intent and deliberation, recklessness or gross and persistent negligence" and "serious consequences, such as false information on the public record, or adverse effects ...": p. 30 of 41 (*section 10: Concepts and definitions / 10.1*) https://www.nhmrc.gov.au/files/nhmrc/file/research/research-integrity/r39_australian_code_responsible_conduct_research_150811.pdf

Tragically, Indigenous Australians in particular are suffering misery and then dying young in droves via excess sugar consumption promoting type 2 diabetes and CVD: <http://www.abc.net.au/news/2016-02-12/scullion-says-sugar-is-killing-remote-communities/7162974>; ("Sugars contributed 25.7%–34.3% of dietary energy, 71% of which was table sugar and sugar-sweetened beverages") <https://www.mja.com.au/journal/2013/198/7/characteristics-community-level-diet-aboriginal-people-remote-northern-australia> ; [http://www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/Lookup/by%20Subject/4727.0.55.003~2012-13~Media%20Release~Aboriginal%20and%20Torres%20Strait%20Islander%20adults%20experience%20diabetes%20%20years%20earlier%20than%20non-Indigenous%20adults%20\(Media%20Release\)~130](http://www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/Lookup/by%20Subject/4727.0.55.003~2012-13~Media%20Release~Aboriginal%20and%20Torres%20Strait%20Islander%20adults%20experience%20diabetes%20%20years%20earlier%20than%20non-Indigenous%20adults%20(Media%20Release)~130)

So much for the millions-of-books-sold claim by JBM, Dr Barclay and Professor Stephen Colagiuri - the main scientific author of taxpayers' *Australian National Diabetes Strategy 2016-2020* - that "There is absolute consensus that sugar in food does not cause [type 2] diabetes": pp. 6 and 12 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Expanded-Letter-HealthDept-type2diabetes.pdf>

Beyond the damage to public health promoted by Charles Perkins Centre's scientists and management recklessly exaggerating their evidence that modern doses of added sugar are not a key driver of Australia's obesity and type 2 diabetes crisis, **the A&CA Investigation Report provides independent confirmation of serious, management-supported research misconduct in formal scientific papers and PhDs at Australia's oldest and most-prestigious Group of Eight universities:** pp. 1, 3, 6, and 7-10 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/USyd-Misconduct-in-ANU-PhD.pdf>

Dr Godlee (and others near and far), thanks for your time. And apologies for my tendency to be long-winded. It may be a factor in my impressive multi-year ineffectiveness in putting a stop to the harmful non-science documented in detail above.

Finally, again, please, urgently, retain a hard copy of this important report - <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/ABC-investigation-AustralianParadox.pdf> - for your records, to assist in any future investigations.

Best wishes,
Rory

rory robertson

Master of Economics (Australian National University)

p. 13 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Big-5-year-update-Feb-2017.pdf>

Much of the high-profile opposition to proposed sugar tax in Australia is based on the *Australian Paradox* sugar-and-obesity fraud: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/australian-sugar-tax-debate.pdf>

During National Diabetes Week, I wrote to the Department of Health about "The scandalous mistreatment of

Australians with type 2 diabetes (T2D)": <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Expanded-Letter-HealthDept-type2diabetes.pdf>

Want to stop trends in your family and friends towards obesity, type 2 diabetes, heart disease and various cancers? Stop eating and drinking sugar: <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xDaYa0AB8TQ&feature=youtu.be>

Here's the diet advised by Dr Peter Brukner, recently the Australian cricket team's doctor: <http://www.peterbrukner.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/08/All-you-need-to-know-about-LCHF1.pdf> ; <http://www.abc.net.au/catalyst/lowcarb/>

A life in our times: Vale Alexander "Sandy" Robertson (1933-2015): <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/AlecRobertson-born2oct33.pdf>

Comments, criticisms, questions, compliments, whatever welcome at strathburnstation@gmail.com

www.strathburn.com

Strathburn Cattle Station is a proud partner of YALARI, Australia's leading provider of quality boarding-school educations for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander teenagers. Check it out at <http://www.strathburn.com/yalari.php>