

# Asking Sydney Uni for update on formal inquiry into *Australian Paradox* scandal

From: rory robertson <[strathburnstation@gmail.com](mailto:strathburnstation@gmail.com)>

Date: Wed, Apr 30, 2014 at 7:00 PM

Subject: Letter to SydUni DV-C(R) re update on formal inquiry into Australian Paradox scandal

To: [jill.trehwella@sydney.edu.au](mailto:jill.trehwella@sydney.edu.au)

Cc: [jennie.brandmiller@sydney.edu.au](mailto:jennie.brandmiller@sydney.edu.au), [alan.barclay@gisymbol.com](mailto:alan.barclay@gisymbol.com), [rordorf@mdpi.com](mailto:rordorf@mdpi.com), [Peter.Howe@newcastle.edu.au](mailto:Peter.Howe@newcastle.edu.au), [jeffrey.bea@ucdenver.edu](mailto:jeffrey.bea@ucdenver.edu), [adam.marcus1@gmail.com](mailto:adam.marcus1@gmail.com), [ivan-oransky@erols.com](mailto:ivan-oransky@erols.com), [vice.chancellor@sydney.edu.au](mailto:vice.chancellor@sydney.edu.au), [dvc.provost@sydney.edu.au](mailto:dvc.provost@sydney.edu.au), [chair.academicboard@sydney.edu.au](mailto:chair.academicboard@sydney.edu.au), [stephen.simpson@sydney.edu.au](mailto:stephen.simpson@sydney.edu.au), [Michael.Spence@sydney.edu.au](mailto:Michael.Spence@sydney.edu.au), [Stephen.Garton@sydney.edu.au](mailto:Stephen.Garton@sydney.edu.au), [Derrick.Armstrong@sydney.edu.au](mailto:Derrick.Armstrong@sydney.edu.au), [Shane.Houston@sydney.edu.au](mailto:Shane.Houston@sydney.edu.au), [John.Hearn@sydney.edu.au](mailto:John.Hearn@sydney.edu.au), [Ann.Brewer@sydney.edu.au](mailto:Ann.Brewer@sydney.edu.au), [Gwynnyth.Llewellyn@sydney.edu.au](mailto:Gwynnyth.Llewellyn@sydney.edu.au), [Kathryn.Refshauge@sydney.edu.au](mailto:Kathryn.Refshauge@sydney.edu.au), [Chris.Peck@sydney.edu.au](mailto:Chris.Peck@sydney.edu.au), [Bruce.Robinson@sydney.edu.au](mailto:Bruce.Robinson@sydney.edu.au), [s.truswell@mmb.usyd.edu.au](mailto:s.truswell@mmb.usyd.edu.au), [debbie.bowman@sydney.edu.au](mailto:debbie.bowman@sydney.edu.au), [tim.payne@sydney.edu.au](mailto:tim.payne@sydney.edu.au), [rebecca.murray@sydney.edu.au](mailto:rebecca.murray@sydney.edu.au), [jane.oakeshott@sydney.edu.au](mailto:jane.oakeshott@sydney.edu.au), [meryl.bradford@sydney.edu.au](mailto:meryl.bradford@sydney.edu.au), [vc.admin@sydney.edu.au](mailto:vc.admin@sydney.edu.au), [kim.bellanderson@sydney.edu.au](mailto:kim.bellanderson@sydney.edu.au), [helen.agus@sydney.edu.au](mailto:helen.agus@sydney.edu.au), [tony.weiss@sydney.edu.au](mailto:tony.weiss@sydney.edu.au), [a.weiss@usyd.edu.au](mailto:a.weiss@usyd.edu.au), [soumela.manatidis@sydney.edu.au](mailto:soumela.manatidis@sydney.edu.au), [margaret.allmanfarinelli@sydney.edu.au](mailto:margaret.allmanfarinelli@sydney.edu.au), [iain.campbell@sydney.edu.au](mailto:iain.campbell@sydney.edu.au), [dee.carter@sydney.edu.au](mailto:dee.carter@sydney.edu.au), [ian.carter@sydney.edu.au](mailto:ian.carter@sydney.edu.au), [arthur.conigrave@sydney.edu.au](mailto:arthur.conigrave@sydney.edu.au), [stuart.cordwell@sydney.edu.au](mailto:stuart.cordwell@sydney.edu.au), [ben.crossett@sydney.edu.au](mailto:ben.crossett@sydney.edu.au), [gareth.denyer@sydney.edu.au](mailto:gareth.denyer@sydney.edu.au), [tom.ferenci@sydney.edu.au](mailto:tom.ferenci@sydney.edu.au), [k.downard@sydney.edu.au](mailto:k.downard@sydney.edu.au), [mitchell.guss@sydney.edu.au](mailto:mitchell.guss@sydney.edu.au), [vanessa.gysbers@sydney.edu.au](mailto:vanessa.gysbers@sydney.edu.au), [ruth.hall@sydney.edu.au](mailto:ruth.hall@sydney.edu.au), [dale.hancock@sydney.edu.au](mailto:dale.hancock@sydney.edu.au), [hush\\_n@chem.usyd.edu.au](mailto:hush_n@chem.usyd.edu.au), [noel.hush@sydney.edu.au](mailto:noel.hush@sydney.edu.au), [jill.johnston@sydney.edu.au](mailto:jill.johnston@sydney.edu.au), [katherine.jukic@sydney.edu.au](mailto:katherine.jukic@sydney.edu.au), [philip.kuchel@sydney.edu.au](mailto:philip.kuchel@sydney.edu.au), [vincy.li@sydney.edu.au](mailto:vincy.li@sydney.edu.au), [tim.newsome@sydney.edu.au](mailto:tim.newsome@sydney.edu.au), [kieron.rooney@sydney.edu.au](mailto:kieron.rooney@sydney.edu.au), [tim.gill@sydney.edu.au](mailto:tim.gill@sydney.edu.au), [hannah.nicholas@sydney.edu.au](mailto:hannah.nicholas@sydney.edu.au), [anna.rangan@sydney.edu.au](mailto:anna.rangan@sydney.edu.au), [reeves@angis.usyd.edu.au](mailto:reeves@angis.usyd.edu.au), [peter.reeves@sydney.edu.au](mailto:peter.reeves@sydney.edu.au), [margaret.sunde@sydney.edu.au](mailto:margaret.sunde@sydney.edu.au), [peter.waterhouse@usyd.edu.au](mailto:peter.waterhouse@usyd.edu.au), [jib\\_anderson@unc.edu](mailto:jib_anderson@unc.edu), [enrico.bignetti@unipr.it](mailto:enrico.bignetti@unipr.it), [jeffrey.blumberg@tufts.edu](mailto:jeffrey.blumberg@tufts.edu), [d.cameron.smith@auckland.ac.nz](mailto:d.cameron.smith@auckland.ac.nz), [francesco.capozi@unibo.it](mailto:francesco.capozi@unibo.it), [karenc@uow.edu.au](mailto:karenc@uow.edu.au), [fdunshea@unimelb.edu.au](mailto:fdunshea@unimelb.edu.au), [wrcraig@andrews.edu](mailto:wrcraig@andrews.edu), [vflood@uow.edu.au](mailto:vflood@uow.edu.au), [faye@cirad.fr](mailto:faye@cirad.fr), [haub@ksu.edu](mailto:haub@ksu.edu), [bengt.jeppsson@med.lu.se](mailto:bengt.jeppsson@med.lu.se), [km.ecklin@uoguelph.ca](mailto:km.ecklin@uoguelph.ca), [kuhlensc@illinois.edu](mailto:kuhlensc@illinois.edu), [leidyh@missouri.edu](mailto:leidyh@missouri.edu), [mjplemay@gmail.com](mailto:mjplemay@gmail.com), [bmeyer@uow.edu.au](mailto:bmeyer@uow.edu.au), [goran.molin@appliednutrition.lth.se](mailto:goran.molin@appliednutrition.lth.se), [k.pentieva@ulster.ac.uk](mailto:k.pentieva@ulster.ac.uk), [caryl.nowson@deakin.edu.au](mailto:caryl.nowson@deakin.edu.au), [pribis@andrews.edu](mailto:pribis@andrews.edu), [samir.samman@sydney.edu.au](mailto:samir.samman@sydney.edu.au), [andrew@scholeylab.com](mailto:andrew@scholeylab.com), [song@msu.edu](mailto:song@msu.edu), [jj.strain@ulster.ac.uk](mailto:jj.strain@ulster.ac.uk), [james.swain@case.edu](mailto:james.swain@case.edu), [tamurat@uab.edu](mailto:tamurat@uab.edu), [teranmd@illinois.edu](mailto:teranmd@illinois.edu), [ustunol@anr.msu.edu](mailto:ustunol@anr.msu.edu), [sv98@columbia.edu](mailto:sv98@columbia.edu), [wendy.ward@utoronto.ca](mailto>wendy.ward@utoronto.ca), [m.westerterp@hb.unimaas.nl](mailto:m.westerterp@hb.unimaas.nl), [susan.whiting@usask.ca](mailto:susan.whiting@usask.ca), [l.williams@rowett.ac.uk](mailto:l.williams@rowett.ac.uk), [zile@msu.edu](mailto:zile@msu.edu), [nutrients@mdpi.com](mailto:nutrients@mdpi.com)

Rory Robertson

30 April 2014

PROFESSOR JILL TREWHELLA

Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research)

THE UNIVERSITY OF SYDNEY

T [+61 2 8627 8150](tel:+61286278150) | F [+61 2 8627 8151](tel:+61286278151)

[jill.trehwella@sydney.edu.au](mailto:jill.trehwella@sydney.edu.au)

Dear Professor Trehwella (and observers near and far),

I hope you are well. On 29 November last year you wrote to say that you had initiated - after nearly two years of prodding from me - an "initial inquiry" into the competence and integrity involved in the Charles Perkins Centre's Australian Paradox research: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/LettersProfTrehwella.pdf>

That was five full months ago. I am writing to ask if you are able, please, to provide an update on the progress of your "initial inquiry"?

Five months - and counting - seems a long time to me, given that the serious problems already were documented in great detail on the LHS of <http://www.australianparadox.com/>

Moreover, ABS investigator Wendy Carlisle's 9 February Background Briefing investigation was completed and aired in barely five weeks: <http://www.abc.net.au/radionational/programs/backgroundbriefing/2014-02-09/5239418> ; <http://www.smh.com.au/national/health/australian-paradox-author-admits-sugar-data-might-be-flawed-20140209-329h1.html>

In any case, you should be aware that the authors - Charles Perkins Centre Professor Jennie Brand-Miller and her Glycemic Index Foundation colleague Dr Alan Barclay: <http://www.glycemicindex.com/> - published a formal Correction in the "journal" Nutrients in the wake of their savaging on ABC national radio: <http://www.mdpi.com/2072-6643/6/2/663/htm>

The fact that the authors corrected several simple arithmetic errors - including reversing their claim on volumes of sugary softdrink sales, from a 10% decrease to a 30% increase - makes a mockery of Vice-Chancellor Dr Michael Spence's 2012 claim that Professor Brand-Miller's research had been properly "peer-reviewed" before publication: (p. 28) <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/AUSTRALIAN-PARADOX-101-SLIDESHOW.pdf>

Professor Trehwella, the authors' correction of (only) several always-obvious errors also makes a mockery of your claim that the clownish paper's quality control somehow involved "internationally accepted standard practice": (p. 9) <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Sept2012-Conversations.pdf>

You must have known very well that a lead author also operating as "Guest Editor" of the publishing journal has nothing to do with "independent and objective peer-review" or "internationally accepted standard practice": [http://www.mdpi.com/journal/nutrients/special\\_issues/carbohydrates](http://www.mdpi.com/journal/nutrients/special_issues/carbohydrates)

**More importantly, there is the issue of scientific fraud. In my opinion, persistent misrepresentation - especially exaggeration - of "evidence" for a claimed scientific "finding" - in this case, "an inverse relationship" between sugar consumption and obesity - boils down to simple scientific fraud.**

Professor Trehwella, the document we discussed in 2012 included a fictional but clearly relevant "Australian Blue Kangaroo" example. If (fictional) Dr Sydney Nutrition failed to retract his self-published claim of having discovered the Australian Blue Kangaroo - a never-before-documented species that would stand alongside the Red and the Grey - then clearly he would be involved in scientific fraud (p. 44 in SLIDESHOW link above).

To me, it is clear that Professor Brand-Miller and Dr Barclay's three "lines of evidence" - for their "finding" of a "consistent and substantial decline" in Australians' sugar consumption - were shredded (again) in Wendy Carlisle's ABC Background Briefing report (link above).

Professor Trehwella, I assume you agree with me that the authors' valid indicators of sugar consumption trend up not down, in their own published charts! (p. 4-6) <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/GraphicEvidence.pdf>

Accordingly, it is outrageous that Professor Brand-Miller and Dr Barclay - her GI-advocate offsider and Head of Research at the Australian Diabetes Council - simply rushed off to claim in a formal scientific journal that there remains "...no material impact on the conclusions of our paper": <http://www.mdpi.com/2072-6643/6/2/663/htm>

In my opinion, this formal misrepresentation of what just happened - this further exaggeration of the "evidence" for their claimed "findings" - is common garden scientific fraud, either deliberate or inadvertent: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/CPCscientistsresponse.pdf>

**In particular, I was shocked by the spectacular untruth told by Professor Brand-Miller, after interrupting ABC investigator Wendy Carlisle: "I'll just correct you there: My paper has not been criticised by any scientist" (minute 23.00 in audio in ABC link above).**

I was shocked because Professor Brand-Miller must have been well aware that her faulty paper has been rubbished publicly by nutrition heavy-hitter Dr Rosemary Stanton (p. 18 <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/22Slideshowaustraliangoestoparadoxcanberrafinal.pdf>) and by Professor Boyd Swinburn (<http://www.smh.com.au/national/health/research-causes-stir-over-sugars-role-in-obesity-20120330-1w3e5.html>), as well as in a formal science journal by five scientists from the University of Western Australia: <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1471-2458/13/668>

I was shocked because I had spoken face-to-face with Professor Brand-Miller in Canberra in November about those five UWA scientists and their critical paper (p. 4 in initial link above).

Indeed, Professor Brand-Miller may have been aware that her low-GI-advocate offsider Dr Barclay had two formal attempts to remove the words "Australian Paradox" from the title of the critical UWA paper: [http://www.biomedcentral.com/imedia/1147493792872314\\_comment.pdf](http://www.biomedcentral.com/imedia/1147493792872314_comment.pdf)

There may be a pattern here. Widely respected journalist Michael Pascoe also has documented serious problems with competence and integrity in this episode: <http://www.smh.com.au/business/pesky-economist-wont-let-big-sugar-lie-20120725-22pru.html>

Professor Trewhella, former NSW Premier Barry O'Farrell was forced from office just weeks ago for providing unreliable information about a bottle of wine. Based on your scientists' persistent misrepresentation/exaggeration of evidence for a "consistent and substantial decline" in sugar consumption between 1980 and 2010, I think it's well past time for the University of Sydney to oversee the retraction of its extraordinarily faulty Australian Paradox paper.

**As I noted in my Submission to your "initial inquiry", formal retraction is the standard way that recklessly false "findings" - especially those that are a danger to public health - are removed from the scientific record:** (pp. 1 and 5) <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/RRsubmission2inquiry.pdf>

Professor Trewhella, you would be aware that I have called publicly for your removal as Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research), because you have failed for two years to ensure competence and integrity in the University of Sydney's research: <http://honisoit.com/2014/03/sweet-research-goes-sour/>

For two years, you have recklessly allowed false yet influential information - much cited by industry and the University of Sydney - to go uncorrected in the critical public debate on the origins of obesity, which together with type-2 diabetes is the greatest public-health challenge of our times.

On a related matter, I wonder if you will agree with me that Group of Eight scientists should be banned from publishing formal research in journals - now including Nutrients - overseen by publishers on Jeffrey Beall's widely followed List of Questionable (Predatory) Publishers. Note the reference to Australian Paradox in <http://scholarlyoa.com/2014/02/18/chinese-publisher-mdpi-added-to-list-of-questionable-publishers/>

Finally, thanks for your time and sorry that we are not corresponding in happier circumstances. Please get in touch if I can provide you with further information, or if the University of Sydney would like to claim that any of my information above is wrong or otherwise unreasonable.

I look forward to hearing from you on the progress or result of your long-running "initial inquiry".

Regards,  
Rory

--

**rory robertson**  
**economist and former-fattie**  
<https://twitter.com/OzParadoxdotcom>

Are you getting fat and sick? Want to stop trends in your family and friends towards obesity, type 2 diabetes, heart disease and various cancers? Well, **it's time to stop eating and drinking sugar:** <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xDaYa0AB8TQ&feature=youtu.be>

Join the push to **give all kids a fairer start in life:** <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/Sugary-Drinks-Ban.pdf>

Click and scroll down for a **time-tested diet to reverse obesity and type 2 diabetes:** <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/why-we-get-fat.pdf> Here's why it works: <http://garytaubes.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/02/WWGF-Readers-Digest-feature-Feb-2011.pdf> ; (case study at minute 12.40) <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DOGSSSE4I8U> ; <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bTUspjZG-wc> ; <http://www.samj.org.za/index.php/samj/article/view/7302>

Outsized rates of sugar consumption – alongside alcohol and tobacco – are **a major driver of the unacceptable "gap" in life expectancy between Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians:** see the bottom row of Box/Table 2 in <https://www.mja.com.au/journal/2013/198/7/characteristics-community-level-diet-aboriginal-people-remote-northern-australia>

Isn't it ironic (or worse)? The **Charles Perkins Centre's** highest-profile obesity and diabetes experts have falsely exonerated as harmless the sugar that's devastating the health of those Australians who Charles Perkins cared most about: <http://www.australianparadox.com/pdf/diabetes.pdf> ; <http://www.rethink sugarydrink.org.au/facts> ; <http://www.smh.com.au/national/university-sets-up-500m-centre-for-obesity-research-20130724-2qjq8.html>

**Comments, criticisms, questions, compliments, whatever welcome at [strathburnstation@gmail.com](mailto:strathburnstation@gmail.com)**  
**[www.strathburn.com](http://www.strathburn.com)**

**Strathburn Cattle Station is a proud partner of YALARI,**  
*Australia's leading provider of quality boarding-school educations for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander teenagers. Check it out at <http://www.strathburn.com/yalari.php>*

Please reply "Please remove" if you would prefer not to receive my occasional updates on public-health matters.